

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

United States of America

v.

Joshua Hall,

*Defendant.*

**Protective Order**

**21 Mag. 5686**

Upon the application of the United States of America, and with the consent of the undersigned counsel, the Court hereby finds and orders as follows:

1. **Disclosure Material.** The Government, as a courtesy to the defendant and to facilitate a potential pre-indictment resolution of this case, will make disclosure to the defendant of certain documents, objects and/or information (“disclosure material”), including electronically stored information (“ESI”), notwithstanding the absence of any obligation by the Government to do so in advance of the filing of an Indictment in connection with this case.

2. The Government’s disclosure material may include material that (i) affects the privacy, confidentiality and business interests of individuals and entities; (ii) would impede, if prematurely disclosed, the Government’s ongoing investigation; (iii) would risk prejudicial pretrial publicity if publicly disseminated; and (iv) that is not authorized to be disclosed to the public or disclosed beyond that which is necessary for the defense of this criminal case.

**NOW, THEREFORE, FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:**

3. Disclosure material shall not be disclosed by the defendant or defense counsel, including any successor counsel (“the defense”) other than as set forth herein, and shall be used by the defense solely for purposes of defending this action. The defense shall not post any disclosure material on any Internet site or network site to which persons other than the parties hereto have

access, and shall not disclose any disclosure material to the media or any third party except as set forth below.

4. Disclosure material may be disclosed by counsel to:

(a) Personnel for whose conduct counsel is responsible, *i.e.*, personnel employed by or retained by counsel, as needed for purposes of defending this action;

(b) Prospective witnesses for purposes of defending this action.

5. The Government may authorize, in writing, disclosure of disclosure material beyond that otherwise permitted by this Order without further Order of this Court.

6. This Order does not prevent the disclosure of any disclosure material in any hearing or trial held in this action, or to any judge or magistrate judge, for purposes of this action. However, disclosure material pertinent to any motion before the Court should initially be filed under seal, absent consent of the Government or Order of the Court. All filings should comply with the privacy protection provisions of Fed. R. Crim. P. 49.1.

7. The Government has advised that information that may be subject to disclosure in this case may be contained within ESI that the Government has seized, pursuant to warrants issued during the course of the investigation, from various email accounts, social media accounts, text message accounts, computers, cellphones, and other devices and storage media. The Government is authorized to disclose to counsel for the defendant, for use solely as permitted herein, the entirety of such seized ESI as the Government believes may contain disclosure material (“the seized ESI disclosure material”). The defendant, defense counsel, and personnel for whose conduct counsel is responsible, *i.e.*, personnel employed by or retained by counsel, may review the seized ESI

disclosure material to identify items pertinent to the defense. They shall not further disseminate or disclose any portion of the seized ESI disclosure material except as otherwise set forth under this Order.

8. Except for disclosure material that has been made part of the record of this case, the defense shall return to the Government or securely destroy or delete all disclosure material, including the seized ESI disclosure material, within 30 days of the expiration of the period for direct appeal from any verdict in the above-captioned case; the period of direct appeal from any order dismissing any of the charges in the above-captioned case; or the granting of any motion made on behalf of the Government dismissing any charges in the above-captioned case, whichever date is later. If disclosure material is provided to any prospective witnesses, counsel shall make reasonable efforts to seek the return or destruction of such materials.

9. The defense shall provide a copy of this Order to prospective witnesses and persons retained by counsel to whom the defense has disclosed disclosure material or the Government's ESI production. All such persons shall be subject to the terms of this Order. Defense counsel shall maintain a record of what information has been disclosed to which such persons.

10. This Order places no restriction on a defendant's use or disclosure of ESI that originally belonged to the defendant.

**Retention of Jurisdiction**

11. The provisions of this order shall not terminate at the conclusion of this criminal prosecution and the Court will retain jurisdiction to enforce this Order following termination of the case.

AGREED AND CONSENTED TO:

AUDREY STRAUSS  
United States Attorney

by: /s/ Robert B. Sobelman  
Robert B. Sobelman  
Assistant United States Attorney

Date: 6/16/2021

/s/ Clay H. Kaminsky  
Clay H. Kaminsky, Esq.  
Counsel for Joshua Hall

Date: 6/16/2021

SO ORDERED:

Dated: New York, New York  
June 16, 2021

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
THE HONORABLE ONA T. WANG  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE